

1 Roy A. Katriel (265463)
2 **THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM**
3 4660 La Jolla Village Drive, Suite 200
4 San Diego, CA 92122
5 Tel: (858) 546-4435
6 Fax: (858) 430-3719
7 E-mail: rak@katriellaw.com

8 Ralph B. Kalfayan (133464)
9 **KRAUSE, KALFAYAN BENINK & SLAVENS, LLP**
10 550 West C Street, Suite 530
11 San Diego, CA 92101
12 Telephone: (619) 232-0331
13 Facsimile: (619) 232-4019
14 E-mail: rkalfayan@kkbs-law.com

15 *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

16 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
17 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
18 **SOUTHERN DIVISION**

19 **ADEL TAWFILIS, DDS d/b/a**
20 **CARMEL VALLEY CENTER FOR**
21 **ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL**
22 **SURGERY, AND HAMID A.**
23 **TOWHIDIAN, M.D., on behalf of**
24 **themselves and all others similarly**
25 **situated,**

26 **Plaintiffs,**

27 **vs.**

28 **ALLERGAN, INC.**

Defendant.

Case No. 8:15-CV-307-JLS (JCGx)

DECLARATON OF RALPH B.
KALFAYAN IN SUPPORT OF
MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES

Judge: Hon. Josephine L. Staton
Courtroom: 10A, 10th Floor
Hearing Date: August 24, 2018
Hearing Time: 2:30 p.m.

1 key fact witnesses; prepared and defended several expert depositions including defending
2 an expert deposition in Madrid, Spain; prepared class representatives for their deposition;
3 drafted Motions in Limine; performed pre-trial work; conducted significant document
4 review work related to the voluminous production of documents from defendant;
5 propounded discovery on Defendant and third party witnesses; participated in case
6 management and discovery; and participated in settlement mediation before the Honorable
7 Edward A. Infante.
8

9
10 5. The total number of hours spent on this litigation, from inception to April 30, 2018,
11 by attorneys, clerks, and paralegals at this firm has been **5,308.92**. Time spent preparing
12 the fee petition and related documents is not included. The total lodestar for this time,
13 calculated at the firm's current hourly rates during the litigation, is **\$2,227,848.50**.
14

15
16 6. Attached hereto as Exhibit 2 is a schedule with the total time spent by each attorney
17 and paralegal of this firm on the case, and the lodestar calculation for that attorney or
18 paralegal based on this firm's current billing rates. The schedule was prepared from
19 contemporaneous daily time records regularly maintained by this firm, which are available
20 at the request of the Court.
21

22 7. This firm has expended a total of **\$859,254.16** in non-reimbursed expenses in
23 connection with the prosecution of this litigation. The bulk of expenses relate to the
24 retention of expert witnesses who helped counsel certify the class and render opinions in
25 preparation of the case for trial. Approximately eighty-six percent (86%) of the expenses
26 were incurred in this category. In addition, expenses for court reporters' transcript costs,
27
28

1 travel costs, third party document handling database services and mediation costs were
2 incurred. This group of expenses comprise approximately nine percent (9%) of the overall
3 costs. Attached as Exhibits 4 to 12 are invoices which support all expenditures in the
4 above two categories of expenses. Finally, copying charges, research charges, meals,
5 supplies, filing fees, and courier services were incurred and make up the balance of costs.
6 These items approximate five percent (5%) of the total costs. For this last category of
7 items, invoices were not attached but will be provided to the Court upon request.
8

9
10 8. Attached hereto as Exhibit 3 is a schedule of all expenses incurred by the firm in
11 prosecuting this case. All the expenses incurred pertaining to this case are reflected in the
12 books and records of this firm maintained in the ordinary course of business. These books
13 and records are prepared from expense vouchers, invoices, check records, and similar
14 items, and are an accurate record of expenses incurred.
15

16
17 9. The two named plaintiff class representatives in this action, Dr. Adel Tawfilis and
18 Dr. Hamid A. Towhidian, devoted their time and efforts to this litigation. Their input and
19 efforts proved invaluable to the successful prosecution and ultimate settlement of this
20 action. Dr. Tawfilis, who runs his own oral surgery practice in San Diego, took time to sit
21 for a day-long deposition in Los Angeles noticed by Allergan's counsel. In preparation
22 for that deposition, Dr. Tawfilis had several in-person meetings with me and my co-
23 counsel, Roy A. Katriel. In addition to preparing for and attending the deposition, Dr.
24 Tawfilis met with associates at my firm to conduct searches of his office and patient files
25 in order to respond to written discovery propounded on him by Allergan. This search and
26
27
28

1 production was time-consuming in that it had to be conducted manually in order to
2 safeguard and redact confidential patient information before production to Allergan.


3 10. Dr. Towhidian runs his own surgical practice in Irvine, California. Like Dr.
4 Tawfilis, Dr. Towhidian also sat for a day-long deposition in Los Angeles noticed by
5 Allergan's counsel. This entailed a significant accommodation by Dr. Towhidian in that
6 the deposition required Dr. Towhidian to clear his patient appointments for the entire day,
7 including postponing surgical procedures that had been scheduled in advance. Prior to
8 sitting for the day-long deposition, Dr. Towhidian met in-person with my co-counsel and
9 me on several occasions, during which he prepared for deposition and reviewed pertinent
10 documents. Dr. Towhidian also was called upon to provide extensive and intrusive
11 documents and records responsive to Allergan's discovery requests. The extent of this
12 discovery and its effect on Dr. Towhidian's surgical practice were the focus of a discovery
13 hearing before Magistrate Judge Jay Gandhi in connection with Allergan's motion to
14 compel. Dr. Towhidian's document search and production was time-consuming and
15 sensitive in that it had to safeguard and appropriately redact confidential patient
16 information before the office files were produced to Allergan's counsel.
17
18
19
20
21

22 ///
23 ///
24 ///
25 ///
26 ///
27 ///
28 ///

1 I declare under penalty of perjury under the law of the United States of America
2 that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information, and belief.

3 EXECUTED this 2nd day of May, 2018, in San Diego, California.
4

5 Respectfully submitted,

6 

7
8 Ralph B. Kalfayan, Esq.
9 KRAUSE, KALFAYAN, BENINK & SLAVENS,
10 LLP

Exhibit 1

KRAUSE, KALFAYAN, BENINK & SLAVENS, LLP

www.kkbs-law.com

KRAUSE, KALFAYAN, BENINK & SLAVENS, LLP (“Krause Kalfayan”) is a leading San Diego-based class-action law firm. Krause Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens, LLP (formerly Krause & Kalfayan) represents individuals, businesses, and institutional investors in complex civil litigation in the areas of securities, antitrust, consumer fraud, partnership and business law. Although the firm handles both individual and class action litigation, it has a substantial reputation as a class action firm and has been at the forefront of multi-million dollar cases against some of the most powerful companies in the world. Krause Kalfayan has obtained numerous significant settlements and judgments for individuals and businesses in California and the United States. In recent years, the firm has expanded its practice to consumer and unfair competition cases, and has obtained substantial results benefitting consumers.

RALPH B. KALFAYAN

Ralph B. Kalfayan received a Bachelor of Science degree in Accounting from the University of San Diego in 1982. He was a member of the honors fraternity Beta Alpha Psi on campus and graduated with honors in his major. He received his Juris Doctor degree in 1985, and his Master of Laws degree with an emphasis in intellectual property in 2012 from University of San Diego School of Law.

Upon graduation, Mr. Kalfayan was employed for three years with the international firm of Arthur Andersen & Co. Mr. Kalfayan worked in the tax department, where he provided tax consulting and tax compliance work and in the audit department, where he reviewed financial statements and helped issue audit opinions.

In 1988, Mr. Kalfayan joined the law firm of Borton, Petrini & Conron, where he became a partner in 1991. Mr. Kalfayan specialized in business litigation and transactional matters including real estate transactions, general commercial transactions, corporate work, partnership work, tax litigation or consulting work, contract disputes, and large acquisition work. Mr. Kalfayan also handled a number of civil trials before a jury and several major appeals.

In August 1993, Mr. Kalfayan became Of Counsel at the Law Offices of James C. Krause, and in January 1994, he became a member of Krause & Kalfayan.

Among the articles Mr. Kalfayan has authored are: Ensuring Access to Affordable Medication: The Supreme Court's Opinion in F.T.C. v. Actavis, Inc. (Summer 2013) in *Competition: The Journal of the Antitrust and Unfair Competition Law Section of the State Bar of California* Vol. 22, No. 2; Buying a Business (April 15, 1993) in *Business and Industry News* Vol. 3, No. 2; Building a Business: Tools for the Entrepreneur (August 1, 1993) In *Business & Industry News* Vol. 3, Number 9; Reducing your Property Taxes in the San Diego Business and tax forecast magazine, December 1991. Seminars conducted by Mr. Kalfayan include: California Sales & Use Tax, Lorman Education Services, December 5, 1991; Business and Finance Conference at Jack Murphy Stadium, December 5, 1990; Estate Planning with Prudential Bache, Spring of 1990.

Mr. Kalfayan has proven himself as a successful litigator. He was on the Executive Committee in the matter of *In re Dynamic Random Access Memory (DRAM)*, Master File No. M-02-1486-PJH, MDL No. 1486, United States District Court Northern District of California, Oakland Division, which was an indirect purchaser case under the antitrust laws, and settled for over \$300 million; *In re Korean Airlines Co. Ltd Antitrust Litigation*, Master File No. CV 07-05107, MDL No. 1891, United States District Court Central District of California, Western Division, which was a direct purchaser case under the antitrust laws, and settled for over \$85

million; *In re Wholesale Electricity Cases I and II*, JCCP 4204, San Diego County Superior Court, which was an indirect purchaser case under the antitrust laws, and settled in amount in excess of \$200 million; *In re Natural Gas Anti-Trust Cases I, II, III, IV & V*, San Diego Superior Court, JCCP Nos. 4221, 4224, 4226, 4228, and which resulted in settlements of \$159 million for plaintiffs. In addition, Mr. Kalfayan successfully obtained a jury verdict in *Emma R. Carbonell, MD, et al. v. Kern Medical Services, Inc., et al.*, in the amount of \$1,504,594.30. He achieved a settlement in the amount of \$1 million in the case of *Gordon Giles v. Weiss Family Trust, et al.*, and achieved a settlement in the amount of \$625,000 in *Sylvia Ortega v. La Estrella Night Club, et al.*, He also reached a settlement in the amount of \$4.5 million in *Doe v. Roes*, Finally, he also achieved a settlement of \$500,000 in *Stewart v GOGO, Inc. Antitrust Litigation*, US District Court Northern District of California, Case No. 3:12-cv-5164-EMC.

Mr. Kalfayan currently works on numerous class actions, including: *In re Antelope Valley Groundwater Litigation*, JCCP 4408, Los Angeles County Superior Court Case Number BC 391869, representing over 70,000 non-pumping landowners in the largest groundwater adjudication in the State of California where the water rights were valued at over one billion dollars; *In Re Cipro I and II*, JCCP 4154 and 4220, in San Diego County Superior Court, where the case was successfully argued before the California Supreme Court, resulting in a published opinion which set the standard for pay-for-delay cases under the Cartwright Act for the State of California, and resulted in a partial settlement with one defendant in the amount of \$74,000,000; *In re Allergan*, Civil Case Number 15-307, United States District Court, Central District of California Southern Division; *In re Lithium Batteries*, Case No. C12-6492 EMC, United States District Court Northern District of California; *In re Processed Egg Indirect Purchaser Antitrust Litigation*, United States District Court Eastern District of Pennsylvania, MDL 2002; and, *Dang v*

National Football League Indirect Purchaser Antitrust litigation, United States District Court Northern District of California, Case No. 5:12-cv-5481-EJD.

ERIC J. BENINK

Mr. Benink was admitted to the California Bar in 1997. He received a Bachelor of Business Administration degree from the University of Massachusetts - Amherst in 1992 and a Juris Doctor and Master of Business Administration degree from the University of San Diego in 1996.

In 1997, Mr. Benink began working in the Enforcement Division of the Department of Corporations, an entity that serves as California's securities, commodities, franchise; and finance and mortgage lender regulator. He investigated dozens of illegal stock offerings, private placement frauds, illicit brokerage practices, and ponzi schemes, and brought civil and administrative actions against the perpetrators. He also worked closely with criminal agencies in their prosecution of alleged violators of laws under the jurisdiction of the Department.

In 2002, Mr. Benink joined Krause & Kalfayan as an Associate, and represents consumers, businesses and shareholders in securities, consumer fraud, and business litigation actions in state and federal court. He has prosecuted consumer and business litigation cases against Wells Fargo Bank, Sprint, Ticketmaster, Fleet Bank, and Apple. Mr. Benink represents hedge funds in securities actions, as well as investors in FINRA arbitrations. In 2005, Mr. Benink became a partner in the firm, which was renamed Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens, LLP.

Mr. Benink is the author of *The Model State Commodities Code, A Regulator's Perspective*, published in the Law Enforcement Reporter, Winter 1999. He has testified as a securities expert witness for the San Diego District Attorney's Office and has been appointed by the San Diego Superior Court as a receiver in three securities fraud cases. Mr. Benink is a member of the San Diego County Bar Association, the Consumer Attorneys of San Diego, a graduate of LEAD San

Diego, and former President of the Old Mission Rotary Club (2009 - 2010). He is a member of the Board of Directors for the George G. Glenner Alzheimer's Centers, Inc. He is also a contributor to the *Trial Bar News*, a publication of the Consumer Attorneys of San Diego.

Mr. Benink acted as Lead Counsel in *Shames v. City of San Diego*, (San Diego Superior Court, Case No. GIC 831539), a class action that recovered \$40 million for residential sewer customers. He has prosecuted numerous class actions cases, including: *Soto v. STI Prepaid, LLC* (San Diego Superior Court, Case No. GIC868083) (violation of prepaid calling card statute); *Neborsky v. Redem Technologies, Inc.* (San Diego Superior Court, Case No. GIC804280) (securities fraud); *Milne v. Ticket Innovations, Inc.* (breach of fiduciary duty to shareholders) (Los Angeles Superior Court, BC 311258); *Ruffalo v. En Pointe Technologies, Inc.* (United States District Court for Southern District of California, 3:01-cv-00205 BEN-AJB) (federal securities fraud); and, *Rivera v. Sprint International Communications Corp.* (San Diego Superior Court, GIC799868) (international phone overcharges). He also represents rate payors in cases involving illegal utility fees in violation of Proposition 218.

VINCENT D. SLAVENS

Mr. Slavens was admitted to the California Bar in 2001. He received his Bachelor of Arts degree in Corporate Finance from San Diego State University in 1994, and graduated with honors (*magna cum laude*) from California Western School of Law in 2001.

Prior to law school, he worked as a licensed investment broker for a number of years. During law school, Mr. Slavens successfully became a member of the California Western School of Law, Law Review. After becoming a member of the California Bar in 2001, he joined Krause & Kalfayan as an Associate Attorney, and has put his securities experience to use in securities litigation, including arbitration matters with the National Association of Securities Dealers

(NASD), now known as FINRA. He has also been involved in class action cases in securities, antitrust, and consumer law. In 2005, he became a partner in the firm, which was renamed Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens, LLP.

Mr. Slavens has been active in the legal community by volunteering with the San Diego Volunteer Lawyer Program, where he participated as a panelist on issues relating to the brokerage industry and corporate scandals; furthermore, he has provided substantial *pro bono* services to a local non-profit organization. He has also written an article on whistle-blower standing under the RICO statutes, as well as an article titled "They Heard It Through The Grapevine," which was accepted for publication in Trial Bar News.

Mr. Slavens has acted as Lead Associate in class actions such as Glea F. Bobbs v. Southern Pacific Equities, LLC, (alleging securities law violations - with settlements over \$7.75 million). He also handled an arbitration on behalf of nearly 20 investors in Larner, et al v. Wedbush Morgan Securities, et al (alleging misrepresentations and violation of securities laws).

Mr. Slavens has also handled more than thirteen arbitrations and has obtained more than \$3,000,000 in settlements or awards. He has represented investors in the following securities cases:

- *Rogers v. Fisher Investment Advisors, Inc., (Arb. No. 73 169 00187 03 JMLE) Arbitration before the American Arbitration Association.* The firm represented an investor who had hired an investment advisor to manage his money prudently. The firm claimed that Fisher Investments breached its contract and was negligent when it invested nearly all of Rogers' assets in the stock market contrary to his stated objectives, resulting in a significant loss. The firm successfully obtained an award at arbitration in favor of client in amount of \$142,210.85.

- *Johnson v. Clements Company Investment Advisors, Inc., (Arb. No. 01-04915) Arbitration before the National Association of Securities Dealers.* The firm represented investors against a brokerage firm, and claimed that the broker recommended investments which were not suitable in view of the clients stated objectives and risk tolerance. The case has settled.
- *Johnsons v. Standex Int'l Corp., dba The Berean Christian Stores, (GIC 797402) Superior Court, San Diego, California.* The firm represented investors against a bookstore, and claimed that it held an investment broker out as its employee or agent and that the book store was vicariously liable under a theory of ostensible agency. The case has settled.
- *Persico v. Sands Bros., Inc., (Arb. No. 01-04617) Arbitration before the National Association of Securities Dealers.* The firm represented an investors against a brokerage firm and claimed that the broker traded stocks in his account without authorization. The case has settled.
- *Mendelsohn v. Seaboard Securities, Inc., et. al. (Arb. No. 02-01976) Arbitration before the National Association of Securities Dealers.* The firm represented an investor against a brokerage firm and claimed that the broker recommended an investment in a “short position” which was highly speculative and not suitable in view of the clients stated objectives and risk tolerance. The case settled.
- *Carolyn Hamburger, et al v. Morgan Stanley DW, et al, (Arb. No. 02-01976) Arbitration before the National Association of Securities Dealers.*

The firm represented investors against a brokerage firm and claimed that the broker recommended an investment program that was speculative and not suitable in view of the clients stated objectives and risk tolerance, and that the broker excessively traded the accounts (*i.e.* “churning”). The case settled.

- *Gladys F. Prince v. McCarn’s Allstate Finance, Inc.*, (GIC 805084) Superior Court, San Diego, California. The firm represented investors against an investment advisor and claimed that the broker violated California law by offering and selling unregistered securities to Ms. Prince. The case settled.

PHILLIP E. STEPHAN (No longer with the firm as of December 2017)

Phillip E. Stephan earned his J.D./M.B.A. from the University of San Diego in 2011, and his B.A. in Global Business, with a minor in Advertising, from the University of Southern California in 2007. He is admitted to practice in California.

Upon graduation from law school, Mr. Stephan worked with Perkins Coie LLP in strategic management, creating comprehensive plans to generate growth and business development. He went on to work with The Mogin Law Firm, P.C., as part of a team of antitrust experts working on complex litigation, including multi-district litigation and suits in both state and federal court. Mr. Stephan worked directly with economic experts, led litigation task teams, and was directly responsible for managing a discovery system to facilitate the firm’s work. Mr. Stephan has also worked with Scott + Scott, Attorneys at Law, LLP, in litigation support for antitrust and securities litigation. Finally, Mr. Stephan has worked and continues to work with entrepreneurs, specializing

in corporate transactions and start-up law, including capital acquisition, strategic management, intellectual property, and contract drafting and management.

On December 7, 2015, Mr. Stephan joined Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens as an Associate Attorney. Mr. Stephan's practice focuses on antitrust actions and complex business litigation. Some of his cases involve antitrust violations by corporate defendants, including "reverse payment" or "pay to delay" settlement agreements between brand name pharmaceutical drug manufacturers and generic drug manufacturers. Mr. Stephan is able to utilize his experience litigating complex antitrust cases and working with businesses to better serve his clients.

Mr. Stephan is active in the legal community. Since 2014, Mr. Stephan has served on the Advisory Board of the Business + Corporate Section of the San Diego County Bar Association, and is serving as the Vice Chair of the Section for 2017-2018, helping to design continuing legal education, plan events, and serve as a liaison between section members and the SDCBA. Mr. Stephan has also been a member of the William L. Todd Jr. American Inn of Court since 2014. Mr. Stephan practices *pro bono* on behalf of Yorkie Rescue of America.

SARAH B. ABSHEAR (No longer with the firm as of January 2018)

Sarah B. Abshear received her juris doctorate from Columbia Law School in 2009, where she was a Harlan Fiske Stone Scholar, an academic honor awarded in recognition of superior performance. In 2006, Ms. Abshear graduated *summa cum laude* from the University of Kentucky with a Bachelor of Arts degree in Political Science and a minor in History. Ms. Abshear was admitted to the state bars of California and New York in 2010. Ms. Abshear is also admitted to practice before the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit; the United States District Courts for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts of California; and the United States District Courts for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York.

From 2009-2012, Ms. Abshear worked as an attorney for Dewey & LeBoeuf, LLP, after clerking for the firm as a summer associate in 2008. For the first two years of her tenure at Dewey, Ms. Abshear participated in the firm's fellowship program, acting as a staff attorney for the American Civil Liberties Union of San Diego & Imperial Counties. At the ACLU, Ms. Abshear's practice consisted of civil rights litigation and advocacy, with a focus on the First Amendment.

Ms. Abshear returned to the New York office of Dewey & LeBoeuf in 2011 as a litigation associate. In 2012, she was one of approximately 60 litigators to leave Dewey and join the litigation department of the New York office of Winston & Strawn, LLP. Ms. Abshear's work at Dewey & LeBoeuf and Winston & Strawn focused on complex commercial litigation and antitrust cases, including class actions, sports litigation, insurance and reinsurance contract disputes between sophisticated parties, and internal and government investigations.

Ms. Abshear joined the Mogin Law Firm in 2014, where her practice focused on complex business litigation and class actions, including antitrust, unfair competition, and consumer protection cases. She subsequently went to work for Buchanan, Ingersoll, & Rooney, LLP, where her practice focused on general civil litigation, including business disputes, contract law, water rights, trade secrets, and employment law.

Ms. Abshear joined Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens as an associate attorney in February 2017. Her practice focuses on complex commercial litigation, class actions, and antitrust. Ms. Abshear has experience with a broad range of litigation across multiple industries, in both federal and state courts. She has handled all stages of case development, from initial claim assessment to post-trial motions and appeals. Ms. Abshear's clients have included Fortune 500 companies, small businesses, classes of plaintiffs, individual plaintiffs and defendants, and government entities. Representative cases include:

- *Kleen Products, LLC v. International Paper, Inc.* (N.D. Ill.) – Represented Plaintiff Class of direct purchasers in suit brought against price-fixing cartel of containerboard producers.
- *Roos v. Honeywell, International, Inc.* (Cal.) – Represented Respondent Class Plaintiffs in appeal of class action settlement by Appellant Objectors.
- Defended corporation and subsidiaries in multidistrict and related putative class actions involving alleged violations of antitrust and consumer protection statutes. Also represented corporation and subsidiaries in relation to investigation and settlement with the United States Department of Justice.
- *7 West 57th Street Realty Company, LLC v. CitiGroup, Inc.* (S.D.N.Y.) – Represented Plaintiff 7 West 57th Street Realty Company in suit brought against Defendant banks for manipulation of U.S. Dollar LIBOR.
- *Saubers v. Kashi Company* (S.D. Cal.) – Represented Plaintiff Class of purchasers in suit brought against Defendant Kashi for misleading consumers with deceptive labelling.
- *Glick v. Bankers Life & Casualty Insurance Company* – Defended insurance company in putative class action regarding allegedly delayed/denied premium payments and “modal premium” claims, the latter of which were summarily rejected on a motion to dismiss.
- *Aqua Clear Water Treatment v. Senior Operations* (Cal.) – Represented aerospace company in breach of contract case brought by its water treatment servicer for nonpayment of contract, including filing cross-complaint regarding breach of contract and fraud to ultimately resolve case with joint dismissal of claims.
- *Stemage Skin Care, LLC v. NuGene International, Inc. et al.* (C.D. Cal.) – Represented skin care company in case alleging competing company interfered with contract of brand ambassador and infringed copyright.
- *NDO America, Inc. v. Ozburn-Hessey Logistics, LLC, et al.* (Cal.) – Represented company in suit alleging theft of trade secrets and solicitation of personnel in violation of non-compete clause.
- *City of Carlsbad and Carlsbad Municipal Water District v. California State Water and Resources Control Board* (Cal.) – Represented City of Carlsbad in action to establish its water rights and SWRCB’s lack of authority to regulate water at issue.

Ms. Abshear is involved in the local community. She is a member of the San Diego Leadership Alliance (SDLA) and a SDLA 2016 Leadership Institute Fellow, where she participated in training in civic engagement, public speaking, fundraising, communications, public policy, campaigns, and organizing. She is a member of the Lawyers Club of San Diego, where she participates on the Annual Dinner Committee, helps plan events, and writes articles for the

monthly newsletter. She is also a member of the San Diego County Bar Association and Federal Bar Association.

VERNEETA JASWAL

Veneeta Jaswal received her juris doctorate from the University of San Diego School of Law in 2017 with a concentration in Business and Corporate Law. In 2014, Ms. Jaswal graduated from San Jose State University with a Bachelor of Science in Justice Studies where she was recognized as a Dean's Scholar, an academic honor awarded for superior performance. Ms. Jaswal was admitted to the state bar of California in 2018.

While in law school, Ms. Jaswal worked as a Research Assistant for Professor Dov Fox, researching various aspects of reproductive law in an effort to articulate a new cause of action. In addition, Ms. Jaswal interned at San Diego Corporate Law where she gained transactional experience with entity formation and document drafting. She also interned with NeuraLace Medical, a San Diego start-up, where she assisted with licensing technology, FDA clearance, and patent applications. Ms. Jaswal worked as a Law Clerk at TechLaw, LLP where she participated in litigation and transactional matters, including breach of contract, gross negligence, and responding to USPTO actions on trademark applications.

Ms. Jaswal joined Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavins as an Associate Attorney in March 2018. Her practice focuses on commercial litigation, class actions, and antitrust.

Ms. Jaswal is actively involved in the local community. She is a member of Junto Global, a peer-to-peer learning environment for young professionals striving to become better leaders. She also serves as the Forum Chair of Junto Global's San Diego chapter board, where she is directly involved with ensuring meeting quality, integrating new members, and proactively

improving member experience. Ms. Jaswal also is a member of the San Diego County Bar Associate and Federal Bar Association.

PUBLICATION: An Evidence Law Approach to Abortion Informed Consent Laws, 6 LAWS: INTERSECTION OF HUM. RTS L. AND HEALTH L. 6 (2017).

Exhibit 2

KRAUSE, KALFAYAN, BENINK & SLAVENS LLP
Application for Fees
Inception to April 30, 2018

<u>Name and Title</u>	<u>Hours Billed</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Total Billed</u>
Ralph B. Kalfayan - Partner	983.25	650.00	639,112.50
Lynn Brennan - Senior Associate	85.70	600.00	51,420.00
Sarah Abshear - Senior Associate	1,155.25	425.00	490,981.25
Phillip Stephan - Associate	2,228.25	375.00	835,593.75
Rafael Yakobi - Associate	240.47	300.00	72,141.00
Ian Krupar - Law Clerk	616.00	225.00	138,600.00
Total	<u>5,308.92</u>		<u>\$ 2,227,848.50</u>

Exhibit 3

KRAUSE, KALFAYAN, BENINK & SLAVENS LLP
Allergan Costs
Inception to April 30, 2018

<u>COSTS</u>	<u>AMOUNT</u>	<u>EXHIBIT #</u>
Experts		
Nathan, Inc.	\$ 655,056.75	4
Kathryn Gilbert	\$ 34,876.00	5
John Geigert, Ph.D.	\$ 18,500.00	6
Ronald L. Moy, M.D.	\$ 24,700.00	7
Consultant	\$ 1,625.00	8
Court Reporters/Transcripts	\$ 31,166.23	9
Epiq Document Handling Database	\$ 21,837.08	10
Mediation Fees	\$ 7,450.00	11
Travel	\$ 20,207.42	12
Westlaw	\$ 22,501.00	
Copying (In House)/Scans/Print/Fax	\$ 14,628.05	
Copying (Outside Vendors)	\$ 3,232.35	
Meals	\$ 2,110.01	
Supplies	\$ 915.84	
Filing Fees; Service of Process; Witness Fees	\$ 276.00	
Courier Services/Attorney Services	\$ 172.43	
TOTAL COSTS	\$ 859,254.16	

Exhibit 4



Washington, D.C. Metro
777 N. Kent St. ♦ Suite 1400 ♦ Arlington, VA ♦ 22209
T 703.516.7700 ♦ F 703.351.6162

Southern California
3 Park Plaza ♦ Suite 1980 ♦ Irvine, CA ♦ 92614 222 N. Sepulveda Blvd ♦ Suite 1730 ♦ El Segundo, CA ♦ 90245
T 949.474.4930 ♦ F 949.474.4944 T 424.888.7046

Statement

Ralph Kalfayan, Esq.
Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavins LLP
550 W. C Street, Suite 530
San Diego, CA 92101

April 25, 2018
Project 50573

Roy Katriel, Esq.
The Katriel Law Firm
4225 Executive Square, Suite 600
San Diego, CA 92037

Re: Adel Tawfilis and Hamid Towhidian v. Allergan, Inc.

BILLED AMOUNTS			PAYMENTS RECEIVED	
Invoice Date	Invoice #	Amount	Date Paid	Amount
2/22/16	800063	\$41,129.16	8/29/16	\$50,000.00
3/22/16	800115	\$30,304.77	12/30/16	\$70,000.00
4/20/16	800154	\$10,043.31	3/27/17	\$50,000.00
5/19/16	800191	\$38,065.12	5/26/17	\$50,000.00
6/22/16	800238	\$14,936.46	9/1/17	\$50,000.00
7/19/16	800255	\$13,931.77	10/27/17	65,000.00
8/12/16	800277	\$113,159.55	11/15/17	\$65,301.11
9/16/16	800329	\$30,628.76	12/18/17	\$65,301.10
10/20/16	800402	\$19,531.50	2/28/18	\$134,397.79
11/18/16	800430	\$76,739.76		\$600,000.00 Total Payments Received
12/15/16	800457	\$77,132.05		
3/14/17	800566	\$564.26		
6/15/17	800701	\$362.74		
7/14/17	800738	\$9,203.70		
8/14/17	800787	\$38,017.96		
9/15/17	800840	\$51,670.62		
10/16/17	800895	\$34,233.35		
11/14/17	800954	\$29,724.35		
12/11/17	800984	\$25,677.56		
		\$655,056.75 Total Billed Amount		

\$55,056.75 Amount Outstanding

Exhibit 5

Kate Gilbert

Independent Marketing Consultant

159 Rainbow Drive #5999
Livingston, TX 77399
Phone: 510 589 0924
Email: kate_gilbert@hotmail.com

INVOICE

DATE 8/29/2017
INVOICE # KT-Aug17

Period Start 7/20/2017
Period End 8/29/2017

BILL TO:

Roy A. Katriel
THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM
4225 Executive Square, Suite 600
La Jolla, CA 92037

Date	Summary	Hours	Rate / Hr	AMOUNT
	Consulting hours: various tasks including	81.5	\$ 250	\$20,375
20-Jul	Review of initial Documents FAC & Merz Depo (1/2)	2.5		
21-Jul	Review of Merz Depo (2/2) Pyott Dep (1/2)	4.5		
24-Jul	Review of Pyott Depo (2/2) & Barboka (1/2)	4.5		
25-Jul	Review of Barborka (2/2) Galderma (1/1) Dosiirjh (1/1)	6		
25-Jul	Kick off call	0.75		
28-Jul	Review of Medytox DWP lawsuit	0.5		
1-Aug	Review of Shaner Depo & AGN Projections	1.5		
8-Aug	Review of Chu Depo & Sanders Depo	3		
10-Aug	Expert Report	4		
12-Aug	Expert Report	4		
13-Aug	Expert Report	5.5		
14-Aug	Expert Report	5.5		
15-Aug	Expert Report	7.5		
16-Aug	Expert Report & compilation of questions	8.5		
17-Aug	Expert Report & compilation of questions	1.25		
21-Aug	Sarah's Timeline tied with exhibits	1.5		
22-Aug	Review of Plaintiff Depo & call	1		
23-Aug	Expert Report Update	3		
24-Aug	Expert Report Update	6		
25-Aug	Expert Report Update	5		
26-Aug	More investigation into duration	2		
29-Aug	Final review of Report, Exhibit list	3.5		
Total				\$20,375

OTHER COMMENTS

Please make payment to: Kathryn Gilbert
EFT / Wire Transfer is preferred
JP Morgan Chase Bank 1415 India St, San Diego CA 92101, USA
Routing Number: 322271627
Account Number: 590539917
Swift Code: CHASUS33

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to work with you.

If you have any questions about this invoice
please don't hesitate to contact me

Thank You!

Kate Gilbert

Independent Marketing Consultant

159 Rainbow Drive #5999

Livingston, TX 77399

Phone: 510 589 0924

Email: kate_gilbert@hotmail.com

INVOICE

DATE 12/1/2017

INVOICE # KT-Nov17

Period Start 11/1/2017

Period End 12/1/2017

BILL TO:

Roy A. Katriel
THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM
4225 Executive Square, Suite 600
La Jolla, CA 92037

Date	Summary	Hours	Rate / Hr	AMOUNT
	Consulting hours: various tasks including	38.5	\$ 250	\$9,625
12-Nov	Review my report, robbins rebuttal, made notes	5.5		
13-Nov	Review Robbins Deposition, my report and notes	7		
14-Nov	Deposition prep pre-meeting	2		
14-Nov	Deposition prep with Sarah	4.5		
15-Nov	Deposition prep on train	2		
15-Nov	Deposition prep with Sarah & Ralph	3		
16-Nov	Deposition	11.5		
	Deposition Transcript Review	3		
EXPENSES				
			Euro	
15-Nov	Train from VLC to Madrid	Renfe		\$162
15-Nov	Taxi Station to Hotel	Taxi	7.55	\$9
15-Nov	Hotel in Madrid	Expedia		\$247
15-Nov	Dinner in Madrid	Jrso Hote	21	\$25
16-Nov	Hotel in Madrid	Jrso Hote	243.1	\$287
16-Nov	Lunch Madrid	Platea	10.8	\$13
17-Nov	Taxi - Hotel to Station	Taxi	7.3	\$9
Total				\$10,376

OTHER COMMENTS

Please make payment to: Kathryn Gilbert
EFT / Wire Transfer is preferred
JP Morgan Chase Bank 1415 India St, San Diego CA 92101, USA
Routing Number: 322271627
Account Number: 590539917
Swift Code: CHASUS33

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to work with you.

If you have any questions about this invoice
please don't hesitate to contact me

Thank You!

Kate Gilbert

Independent Marketing Consultant

159 Rainbow Drive #5999

Livingston, TX 77399

Phone: 510 589 0924

Email: kate_gilbert@hotmail.com

INVOICE

DATE 10/5/2017

INVOICE # KT-Sep17

Period Start 9/15/2017

Period End 9/28/2017

BILL TO:

Roy A. Katriel
THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM
4225 Executive Square, Suite 600
La Jolla, CA 92037

Date	Summary	Hours	Rate / Hr	AMOUNT
	Consulting hours: various tasks including	16.5	\$ 250	\$4,125
15-Sep	Review of AGN response	2		
19-Sep	Rebuttal Report	8.5		
27-Sep	Rebuttal Report	5		
28-Sep	Final review of rebuttal report	1		
Total				\$4,125

OTHER COMMENTS

Please make payment to: Kathryn Gilbert
EFT / Wire Transfer is preferred
JP Morgan Chase Bank 1415 India St, San Diego CA 92101, USA
Routing Number: 322271627
Account Number: 590539917
Swift Code: CHASUS33

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to work with you.

If you have any questions about this invoice
please don't hesitate to contact me

Thank You!



Exhibit 6

**BioPharmaceutical
Quality
Solutions**

**3533 Corte Esperanza
Carlsbad, CA 92009**

**760-943-0198 (Phone)
760-943-7146 (FAX)
BPQS@aol.com**

September 30, 2017

Roy A. Katriel, Esq.
The Katriel Law Firm
4225 Executive Square, Suite 600
La Jolla, CA 92037



Dear Roy:

Attached is the invoice for my services to your firm for the month of September 2017:

TOTAL: \$ 15,500.00 (Please make check out to "John Geigert")

Compensation (\$500/hr): \$ 15,500.00

Sept 09-10: Review declaration of Rita Patel (5 hrs)	(\$2500)
Sept 11-12: Phone call with Roy; review new AGN exhibits (3 hrs)	(\$1500)
Sept 13-14: Initial drafting and scoping out of rebuttal report (3 hrs)	(\$1500)
Sept 15-16: Review of Patel deposition (6 hrs)	(\$3000)
Sept 17-18: Prepared draft rebuttal report (8 hrs)	(\$4000)
Sept 23-24: Incorporated comments into rebuttal report (5 hrs)	(\$2500)
Sept 27: Final editing of rebuttal report; signature and submission to Roy (1 hr)	(\$500)

Expenses: \$ 0

Sincerely

John Geigert

John Geigert, Ph.D., RAC

**BioPharmaceutical
Quality
Solutions**

**3533 Corte Esperanza
Carlsbad, CA 92009**

**760-943-0198 (Phone)
760-943-7146 (FAX)
BPQS@aol.com**

November 30, 2017

Roy A. Katriel, Esq.
The Katriel Law Firm
4225 Executive Square, Suite 600
La Jolla, CA 92037

Dear Roy:

Attached is the invoice for my services to your firm for the month of November 2017:



TOTAL: \$ 3000.00 (Please make check out to "John Geigert")

Compensation (\$500/hr): \$ 3000.00

Nov 28-29: Review rebuttal report of Rita Patel, and my previous reports (6 hrs) (\$3000)
Nov 30: END

Expenses: \$ 0

Sincerely

John Geigert

John Geigert, Ph.D., RAC

Exhibit 7

Ronald L. Moy, M.D.
421 N. Rodeo Dr
Beverly Hills, CA 90210

Invoice

Invoice #: 1134
Invoice Date: 12/5/2017
Due Date: 12/5/2017
Case:
P.O. Number:

Bill To:

Krause Kalfayan Benink &
Slavens, LLP
550 W. C St.
San Diego, CA 92101

Description	Hours/Qty	Rate	Amount
Telephone conference with P. Stephan to discuss legal case	2	950.00	1,900.00
Prep for legal case; research & document review	8	950.00	7,600.00
In person legal case review	4	950.00	3,800.00
Telephone Rebuttal review	2	950.00	1,900.00
Deposition and travel	10	950.00	9,500.00
Total			\$24,700.00
Payments/Credits			\$0.00
Balance Due			\$24,700.00

Exhibit 8

Invoice



Date: 01 April 2017
Time Period: 01 March – 31 March

To: Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens, LLP
550 W. C Street, Suite 530
San Diego, CA 92101

Regulatory Consulting Services

Hourly Rate
\$250.00

Project: Allergan case

Date	Description of Activity	Hours	Amount
3/1/2017	Telephone consultation re: general scientific and technical matters	0.5	
3/11/2017		0.5	
		Subtotal	1.0 \$250.00
		TOTAL	1.0 \$250.00

Exhibit 9



Irvine

20 Corporate Park
Suite 350
Irvine, CA 92606
P 949.955.3855
F 949.955.3854

Los Angeles

707 Wilshire Boulevard
Suite 3500
Los Angeles, CA 90017
P 866.299.5127
F 213.228.1193

Las Vegas

2250 S. Rancho Drive
Suite 195
Las Vegas, NV 89102
P 702.360.3206
F 702.873.9235

Sacramento

555 Capitol Mall
Suite 280
Sacramento, CA 95814
P 916.379.5553
F 916.379.5554

San Diego

550 West C Street
Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101
P 619.231.0403
F 619.923.2426

San Francisco

101 Montgomery
Suite 450
San Francisco, CA 94104
P 415.274.9977
F 415.274.9998

Inv #	Client	Total client	Invoice date	Plaintiff	Defendant
3162168	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	4558.2400	12/21/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
3160423	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	6154.8300	11/22/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
3069940	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	503.2500	08/21/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, Et Al	Allergan, Ir
3047793	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	948.7500	07/28/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, Et Al	Allergan, Ir
3036149	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	928.9100	07/19/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, Et Al	Allergan, Ir
2996464	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	2276.7500	06/08/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2990840	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	1838.7500	06/02/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2985833	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	1817.8000	05/30/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2973020	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	1245.3300	05/18/2017 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2762602	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	1400.7400	10/04/2016 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2762406	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	3591.9000	10/04/2016 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2749873	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	2489.8600	09/22/2016 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2606208	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	1124.3000	04/13/2016 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir
2587600	Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens	735.5700	03/24/2016 00:00:00	Adel Tawfik, DDS	Allergan, Ir

\$31,166.23

Exhibit 10



#37652

Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens, LLP

3/31/2016 Invoice	938256 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 515.40	\$		4/30/2016
4/29/2016 Payment	4611		\$ (515.40)	\$		938256 4/29/2016
4/30/2016 Invoice	944453 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 702.60	\$		5/30/2016
5/31/2016 Invoice	948437 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 585.00	\$		6/30/2016
6/21/2016 Payment	4661		\$ (702.60)	\$		944453 6/21/2016
6/30/2016 Invoice	954391 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 929.30	\$		7/30/2016
7/25/2016 Payment	4683		\$ (585.00)	\$		948437 7/25/2016
7/31/2016 Invoice	960045 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 665.00	\$		8/30/2016
8/11/2016 Payment	4705		\$ (929.30)	\$		954391 8/11/2016
8/31/2016 Invoice	967462 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 585.00	\$		9/30/2016
9/2/2016 Payment	4714		\$ (665.00)	\$		960045 9/2/2016
9/30/2016 Invoice	973309 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 585.30	\$		10/30/2016
10/3/2016 Payment	4744		\$ (585.00)	\$		967462 10/3/2016
10/31/2016 Invoice	976264 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 710.00	\$		11/30/2016
11/21/2016 Payment	4781		\$ (710.00)	\$		976264 11/21/2016
11/30/2016 Invoice	983458 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 795.00	\$		12/30/2016
12/27/2016 Payment	4807		\$ (585.30)	\$		973309 12/27/2016
12/31/2016 Invoice	989112 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 842.66	\$		1/30/2017
1/13/2017 Payment	4825		\$ (795.00)	\$		983458 1/13/2017
1/31/2017 Invoice	993959 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 1,635.52	\$		3/2/2017
2/28/2017 Invoice	999723 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 1,387.44	\$		3/30/2017
3/20/2017 Payment	4874		\$ (842.66)	\$		989112 3/20/2017
3/20/2017 Payment	4874		\$ (1,635.52)	\$		993959 3/20/2017
3/20/2017 Payment	4874		\$ (1,387.44)	\$		999723 3/20/2017
3/31/2017 Invoice	1006460 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 1,068.81	\$		4/30/2017
4/24/2017 Payment	4897		\$ (1,068.81)	\$		1006460 4/24/2017
4/30/2017 Invoice	1011673 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 840.00	\$		5/30/2017
5/19/2017 Payment	4915		\$ (840.00)	\$		1011673 5/19/2017
5/31/2017 Invoice	1017031 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 1,695.49	\$		6/30/2017
6/23/2017 Payment	4940		\$ (1,695.49)	\$		1017031 6/23/2017
6/30/2017 Invoice	1021907 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 1,255.00	\$		7/30/2017
7/17/2017 Payment	4966		\$ (1,255.00)	\$		1021907 7/17/2017
7/31/2017 Invoice	1027544 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 942.50	\$		8/30/2017
8/31/2017 Invoice	1033364 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 1,092.10	\$		9/30/2017
9/30/2017 Invoice	1019376 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 841.20	\$		10/30/2017
10/23/2017 Payment	4989		\$ (942.50)	\$		1027544 10/23/2017
10/31/2017 Invoice	1035852 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 841.20	\$		11/30/2017
11/30/2017 Invoice	1044188 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 841.20	\$		12/30/2017
12/5/2017 Payment	5061		\$ (1,092.10)	\$		1033364 12/5/2017
12/7/2017 Payment	0000005067-A		\$ (841.20)	\$		1019376 12/7/2017
12/7/2017 Payment	0000005067-B		\$ (841.20)	\$		1035852 12/7/2017
12/26/2017 Payment	5077		\$ (841.20)	\$		1044188 12/26/2017
12/31/2017 Invoice	1049129 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 620.34	\$		1/30/2018
1/22/2018 Payment	5098		\$ (620.34)	\$		1049129 1/22/2018
1/31/2018 Invoice	1056475 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 620.34	\$	620.34	3/2/2018
2/28/2018 Invoice	1058909 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 620.34	\$	620.34	3/30/2018
3/31/2018 Invoice	1067678 Allergan	RALPH KALFAYAN	\$ 620.34	\$		4/30/2018
4/23/2018 Payment	5157		\$ (620.34)	\$		1067678 4/23/2018
PROJECT TOTAL			\$21,837.08	\$(20,596.40)	\$	1,240.68

Exhibit 11



INVOICE

Invoice Date
09/20/17

Invoice Number
0004139240-100

To: **Ralph B. Kalfayan, Esq.**
Krause Kalfayan Benink & Slavens LLP
550 West C Street
Suite 530
San Diego, CA 92101

Reference #: **1100088508** SBC
Billing Specialist: **Glenn Mason**
Email: **gmason@jamsadr.com**
Telephone: **(949) 224-4654**
Employer ID: **68-0542699**

RE: **Tawfilis, Adel D.D.S., dba Carmel Valley Center For Oral And Maxillofacial Surgery, et al. vs. Allergan, Inc.**

Representing: **Adel Tawfilis, D.D.S. ; Hamid A. Towhidian, M.D.**

Neutral(s): **Hon. Edward Infante (Ret.)**

Hearing Type: **Mediation**

Rep# 2

Date/Time	Description	Hours	Total Billed	Parties Billed	Your Share
-----------	-------------	-------	--------------	----------------	------------

10/16/17	Hon. Edward Infante (Ret.)	8.00	14,000.00	2	7,000.00
9:00:00AM	Session Time				

09/20/17	Initial Non-Refundable Fee				450.00
----------	----------------------------	--	--	--	--------

Fees 7,450.00

Total \$ 7,450.00

Outstanding Balance as of 09/20/17 \$ 7,450.00

Invoice total is based on the fee split agreed upon by all parties. If the case cancels or continues, fees are due per our cancellation and continuance policy. Please make checks payable to JAMS, Inc. **Payment is due upon receipt.**

Standard mail:
P.O. Box 845402
Los Angeles, CA 90084

Overnight mail:
18881 Von Karman Ave. Suite 350
Irvine, CA 92612

Exhibit 12

Selection Criteria

Clie.Selection Include: Allergan
Acti.Selection Include: Travel Expense

Rate Info - identifies rate source and level

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
100727	EXP	Misc. costs	1	14.00	14.00
12/9/2015		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Ace Parking.					
103079	EXP	Misc. costs	1	107.19	107.19
5/27/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phillip Stephan-reimburse for travel expenses.					
103687	EXP	Misc. costs	1	53.65	53.65
7/9/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Travel reimbursement for P. Stephan.					
104947	EXP	Misc. costs	1	65.63	65.63
9/9/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Uber.					
104703	EXP	Misc. costs	1	99.46	99.46
9/14/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan-travel reimbursement.					
104950	EXP	Misc. costs	1	19.65	19.65
9/17/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Uber.					
104951	EXP	Misc. costs	1	10.29	10.29
9/18/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Uber.					

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
106311	EXP	Misc. costs	1	469.98	469.98
9/21/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Southwest Airlines - travel for Max Talbott.					
104870	EXP	Misc. costs	1	725.88	725.88
9/21/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Hotel					
104869	EXP	Misc. costs	1	284.76	284.76
9/21/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
American Airlines.					
104949	EXP	Misc. costs	1	8.00	8.00
9/22/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
SWA.					
104948	EXP	Misc. costs	1	33.81	33.81
9/23/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Uber.					
111726	EXP	RKalfayan	1	132.00	132.00
9/26/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Mileage- Depo of Dr. T					
104867	EXP	Misc. costs	1	40.50	40.50
9/27/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
City National Parking Plaza.					
105292	EXP	Misc. costs	1	14.28	14.28
9/29/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Uber.					
104874	EXP	Misc. costs	1	30.00	30.00
9/30/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Amtrak.					
105310	EXP	Misc. costs	1	269.86	269.86
10/27/2016		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
Phil Stephan - reimbursement for travel expense regarding depositions.					
108101	EXP	Misc. costs	1	437.88	437.88
3/30/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Southwest Airlines.					
108185	EXP	Misc. costs	1	92.23	92.23
5/12/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Ian Krupar-travel mileage reimbursement for 5/12/17 deposition.					
108102	EXP	Misc. costs	1	66.08	66.08
5/15/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Southwest Airlines.					
108146	EXP	Misc. costs	1	90.31	90.31
5/17/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Absher - reimbursement for mileage for deposition in Irvine.					
108142	EXP	Misc. costs	1	59.28	59.28
5/18/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Comfort Inn By the Way - Parking.					
108141	EXP	Misc. costs	1	503.98	503.98
5/18/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Comfort Inn By the Way.					
108147	EXP	Misc. costs	1	39.00	39.00
5/18/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Absher - reimbursement for airport parking for deposition in San Francisco.					
108148	EXP	Misc. costs	1	13.01	13.01
5/18/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - reimbursement for fuel for rental car for deposition in San Francisco.					

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
108143	EXP	Misc. costs	1	166.88	166.88
5/18/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Dollar Rental Car.					
108558	EXP	Misc. costs	1	2,564.60	2,564.60
5/31/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement for depositions in Europe.					
108546	EXP	Misc. costs	1	550.10	550.10
6/22/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - Delta reimbursement for Mertz					
108557	EXP	Misc. costs	1	671.47	671.47
6/26/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement for depositions in Europe.					
108556	EXP	Misc. costs	1	377.12	377.12
6/26/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - hotel reimbursement for Mertz					
108580	EXP	Misc. costs	1	96.30	96.30
6/29/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - mileage reimbursement for court appearance in Los Angeles.					
108579	EXP	Misc. costs	1	12.00	12.00
6/29/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - reimbursement for parking for court appearance in Los Angeles.					
108735	EXP	Misc. costs	1	59.49	59.49
7/7/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Ralph Kalfayan - mileage reimbursement for meeting with Dr. Towhidian.					

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
108841	EXP	Misc. costs	1	83.57	83.57
7/18/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - mileage reimbursement for meeting with Dr. Towhidian .					
108828	EXP	Misc. costs	1	295.08	295.08
7/19/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement for Hartman deposition.					
108834	EXP	Misc. costs	1	97.83	97.83
7/21/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement for Hartman deposition.					
109628	EXP	Misc. costs	1	161.50	161.50
10/2/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - travel reimbursement (airfare) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
109629	EXP	Misc. costs	1	458.79	458.79
10/2/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - travel reimbursement (hotel) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
109680	EXP	Misc. costs	1	453.32	453.32
10/5/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement (hotel) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
109679	EXP	Misc. costs	1	277.13	277.13
10/5/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement (flight) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
109700	EXP	Misc. costs	1	500.00	500.00
10/9/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Ralph B. Kalfayan flight for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
110074	EXP	Misc. costs	1	121.24	121.24
10/16/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Uber - Ralph B. Kalfayan travel for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
110003	EXP	Misc. costs	1	140.76	140.76
10/16/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement (meals, transportation) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
109874	EXP	Misc. costs	1	583.66	583.66
10/16/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Hilton - Ralph B. Kalfayan hotel for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
110030	EXP	Misc. costs	1	153.29	153.29
10/16/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - travel reimbursement (meals, transportation) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
110460	EXP	Misc. costs	1	143.13	143.13
10/20/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement (meals, transportation) for mediation in San Francisco (10/16).					
110472	EXP	Misc. costs	1	6.49	6.49
10/27/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - toll road reimbursement for MSJ					
110461	EXP	Misc. costs	1	98.98	98.98
10/27/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement (mileage) for hearing regarding MSJ in Santa Ana.					

Slip ID		User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time		Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status		Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description		Reference	Variance		
110470	EXP	Misc. costs	1	262.98	262.98
10/29/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Southwest Airlines - (RBK flight to Oakland).					
110079	EXP	Misc. costs	1	2,207.29	2,207.29
11/2/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement for deposition of Kate Gilbert in Spain.					
110134	EXP	Misc. costs	1	1,770.16	1,770.16
11/7/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Ralph Kalfayan - travel reimbursement (airfare) for deposition of Kate Gilbert in Spain.					
110133	EXP	Misc. costs	1	301.74	301.74
11/13/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Phil Stephan - travel reimbursement (mileage) for deposition preparation and deposition of Moy.					
110468	EXP	Misc. costs	1	384.97	384.97
11/14/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Westin Bonaventure (RBK hotel).					
110249	EXP	Misc. costs	1	52.95	52.95
11/15/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Lopez Rubio Grand Class - taxi for Ralph Kalfayan					
110248	EXP	Misc. costs	1	826.22	826.22
11/16/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
American Airlines - Ian Krupar airfare for deposition of Talbott.					
110247	EXP	Misc. costs	1	260.82	260.82
11/17/2017		Travel Expense			
WIP		Allergan			
Ian Krupar - travel reimbursement (hotel) for deposition of Talbott.					

Slip ID	User	Units	Rate	Slip Value
Dates and Time	Activity	DNB Time	Rate Info	
Posting Status	Client	Est. Time	Bill Status	
Description	Reference	Variance		
110469 11/17/2017 WIP Hotel in Spain (RBK hotel).	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	834.28	834.28
110359 11/19/2017 WIP Ian Krupar - Airport Bag Fee.	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	25.00	25.00
110462 11/20/2017 WIP Sarah Abshear - travel reimbursement for deposition of K. Gilbert in Spain.	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	975.13	975.13
110365 11/21/2017 WIP Ian Krupar - Hotel Wifi Access	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	16.18	16.18
110366 11/21/2017 WIP Ian Krupar - Airline Bag Fee.	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	25.00	25.00
110463 11/23/2017 WIP Travel RBK Spain	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	227.32	227.32
110433 11/27/2017 WIP Phil Stephan - mileage reimbursement for deposition preparation with Russ Mangum.	EXP Misc. costs Travel Expense Allergan	1	151.94	151.94
111727 11/30/2017 WIP Mileage- Depo of Dr. Moy	EXP RKalfayan Travel Expense Allergan	1	132.00	132.00
Grand Total				
	Billable	0.00		20,207.42
	Unbillable	0.00		0.00
	Total	0.00		20,207.42